
Vinnsla og vörubróun
Processing and Product
Development

Líftækni
Biotechnology



Matvælaöryggi
Food Safety



QALIBRA - Cluster Meeting Report and Minutes from the 2nd Cluster meeting for the QALIBRA and BENERIS projects

Helga Gunnlaugsdóttir
Björn Þorgilsson

Matvælaöryggi
Skýrsla Matis 03-08
Febrúar 2008

ISSN 1670-7192

Titill / Title	QALIBRA - Cluster Meeting Report and Minutes from the 2nd Cluster meeting of the QALIBRA and BENERIS projects		
Höfundar / Authors	Helga Gunnlaugsdóttir, Björn Þorgilsson		
Skýrsla / Report no.	03-08	Útgáfudagur / Date:	Febrúar 2008
Verknr. / project no.	34251681		
Styrktaraðilar / funding:	European Commission <i>Matis, CSL, RIVM, WU, Upatras, Altagra, Ipimar</i>		
Ágrip á íslensku:	<p>Þessi verkefnaskýrsla greinir frá sameiginlegum fundi í tveimur evrópskum verkefnum sem nefnast QALIBRA og BENERIS. Fundurinn var haldinn í Helsinki í Finnlandi 6. til 9. nóvember 2007. Bæði verkefnið heyrir undir Priority 5, Food Quality & Safety í 6. Rannsóknaráætlun ESB og deila sumum verkþáttum.</p> <p>Tilgangur fundarins var:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Úttekt tveggja eftirlitsaðila frá ESB á vinnu verkefnanna fyrstu 18 mánuðina 2) Tryggja upplýsingaflæði milli verkefna og ræða áframhaldandi samstarf 3) Umsögn og tillögur vísingaráðgjafanefndar verkefnanna um vinnuna og framhaldið <p>QALIBRA, eða “Quality of Life – Integrated Benefit and Risk Analysis. Web-based tool for assessing food safety and health benefits,” skammstafað QALIBRA (Heilsuvogin á íslensku), er þriggja og hálf árs verkefni sem Matís stýrir. Verkefnistjóri er Helga Gunnlaugsdóttir, deildarstjóri á Matís.</p> <p>Makmið QALIBRA - verkefnisins er að þróa magnbundar aðferðir til að meta bæði jákvæð og neikvæð áhrif innihaldsefna í matvælum á heilsu manna. Markmiðið er að setja þessar aðferðir fram í tölvuforriti sem verður opið og aðgengilegt öllum hagsmunaaðilum á vefnum.</p> <p>Markmið BENERIS verkefnisins er að skapa aðferðafræði til að meðhöndla flóknar ávinnings-áhættu aðstæður, og nota þær síðan til að meta ávinning/áhættu sem ákveðnar tegundir matvæla geta haft í för með sér. Fyrsta tegund matvæla sem unnið verður með við þróun þessarar aðferðafræði er sjávarfang.</p> <p>Þessi skýrsla greinir frá umræðum og helstu niðurstöðum fundarins.</p>		
Lykilorð á íslensku:	<i>Áhættu- og heilnæmismat, klasavinna, matvæli, fiskur, aðferðaþróun</i>		

Summary in English:

This report is a summary of the 2nd Cluster meeting of the QALIBRA and the BENERIS projects in Helsinki, Finland, November 6-9th, 2007. Both projects are funded by the EC's 6th framework programme, and have the same contract starting dates and a common workpackage (WP6) for cluster activities. Both projects began on April 1st 2006 and will run until October 2009, or for 42 months. This report contains results of the discussions that took place and the actions defined, while the overheads presented during the meeting are compiled in an Annex to the report.

The overall objective of QALIBRA is to develop a suite of quantitative methods for assessing and integrating beneficial and adverse effects of foods, and make them available to all stakeholders as web-based software for assessing and communicating net health impacts.

The overall objective of BENERIS is to create a framework for handling complicated benefit-risk situations, and apply it for analysis of the benefits and risks of certain foods. The first food commodity to be used in the development of the methodology is seafood.

The objective of the Cluster meeting was:

- 1) Evaluation (by two independent experts appointed by the EC) of activities from the beginning of the projects until the meeting
- 2) Sharing of information on scientific progress and plans between Qalibra and Beneris, as well as planning of further cluster activities
- 3) Obtain feedback and advice from the Qalibra/Beneris Scientific Advisory Panel (SAP)

This report contains results of the discussions that took place and the actions defined.

English keywords: *Risk-benefit analysis, cluster activities, seafood, fish,*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. SUMMARY	1
2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	2
3. LIST OF PARTNERS IN THE CLUSTERED PROJECTS AND PARTICIPANTS OF THE MEETING	2
4. ORGANISATION AND AGENDA FOR THE MEETING	4
5. SUMMARY OF MEETING ACTIONS	7
5.1. Summary of the discussions, main conclusions and the actions defined	7
6. CONCLUSIONS	9
 APPENDIX Overheads presented during the meeting.	J

1. SUMMARY

This report describes the outcome of the second Cluster meeting of the QALIBRA and the BENERIS projects held at KTL, Helsinki, Finland, November 6-9th, 2007. Both the projects are funded by the European Commission's 6th framework programme, and have the same contract start dates and a common workpackage (WP6) for the cluster activities. Both the projects started on April 1st 2006 and will run until October 2009, or for 42 months. This report contains results of the discussions that took place and the actions defined, while the overheads presented during the meeting are compiled in an Annex to the report.

The objective of the Cluster meeting was:

- 1) Evaluation (by two independent experts appointed by the EC) of activities from the beginning of the projects until the meeting
- 2) Sharing of information on scientific progress and plans between Qalibra and Beneris, as well as planning of further cluster activities
- 3) Obtain feedback and advice from the Qalibra/Beneris Scientific Advisory Panel (SAP)

The meeting thus served multiple purposes, focusing on the review of activities, while also facilitating the sharing of information between these projects as well as the consultation of the Qalibra/Beneris SAP. The meeting was organised in such manner that the first day of the meeting the participants of the Qalibra and Beneris projects presented the progress of their projects to the EC reviewers and the SAP. The second day the two project consortia convened their separate project meetings for detailed discussion of technical and project management issues, the reviewers started drafting their evaluation reports, based on the presentations, discussions, and advance documents and the SAP met to discuss the projects on their own and to agree on their feedback to both project consortia. The third day the participants from both projects reconvened and the SAP provided feedback to each project and participated in discussions of the matters raised. Further, the next stages of each project were discussed together with the SAP and the next phase of the cluster activities was discussed and action points defined.

During the meeting notes were taken and actions defined. In total there are 6 actions related to cluster activities, which are presented with bold letters in chapter 5 of this report. For each action either a person or partner is defined that is responsible for the action and a deadline is given for the finalisation of the action. The finalisations of actions on time should ensure the progress of the cluster activities in the two EU projects.

2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The QALIBRA consortia would like to thank KTL for hosting the meeting, and in particular Jouni Tuomisto and his KTL team for organising it in such a good manner. The two project consortia would like to thank the members of the SAP and EC reviewers for their feedback, comments and active participation in the discussions during the meeting.

3. LIST OF PARTNERS IN THE CLUSTERED PROJECTS AND PARTICIPANTS OF THE MEETING

The participants in the QALIBRA project are:

1. Mátis ohf (coordinator) (Matis), Iceland
2. Central Science Laboratory (CSL), United Kingdom
3. National Institute of Public Health and The Environment (RIVM), The Netherlands
4. Wageningen University (WU), The Netherlands
5. University of Patras (UPATRAS), Greece
6. Altagra Business Service (ALTAGRA), Hungary
7. National Institute for Agriculture and Fisheries Research (INIAP/IPIMAR), Portugal

Attending the cluster meeting from QALIBRA

Atkinson Matthew	CSL	m.atkinson@csl.gov.uk
Avouris Nikolaos	UPATRAS	avouris@upatras.gr
Bandarra Narcisa	IPIMAR	narcisa@ipimar.pt
Fidas Christos	UPATRAS	fidass@ece.upatras.gr
Gunnlaugsdottir Helga	Mátis	helga.gunnlaugsdottir@matis.is
Hart Andrew (Andy)	CSL	a.hart@csl.gov.uk
Hoekstra Jeljer	RIVM	Jeljer.Hoekstra@rivm.nl
Nunes Maria Leonor	IPIMAR	mlnunes@ipimar.pt
Thorgilsson Bjorn	Mátis	bjorn.thorgilsson@matis.is
Wentholt Meike	WU	meike.wentholt@wur.nl
Zeilmaker Marco	RIVM	MJ.Zeilmaker@rivm.nl
Flari Vasiliki (Villie)	CSL	v.flari@csl.gov.uk

The participants in the BENERIS project are:

1. National Public Health Institute (coordinator) (KTL) Finland
2. Delft University of Technology, (TUDelft), Netherlands
3. Oy Foodfiles Ltd, (Ffiles) Finland
4. Food Safety Authority of Ireland, (FSAI), Ireland
5. Food Research Institute of Denmark, (DFVF), Denmark
6. Food Safety Authority of Denmark, (FVST), Denmark
7. Lendac Ltd, (Lendac), Ireland
8. Fundación Privada para la Investigación Nutricional, (FIN), Spain

Attending the cluster meeting from BENERIS

Conway Edel	FSAI	econway@fsai.ie
Cooke Roger	TU Delft	r.m.cooke@ewi.tudelft.nl , cooke@rff.org
Gradowska Patrycja	TU Delft	P.L.Jesionek@ewi.tudelft.nl
Hansen Max	DTU	MXH@food.dtu.dk
Henríquez-Hernández Luis Alberto	FIN	lhenriquez@becarios.ulpgc.es
Hirvonen Tero	KTL	Tero.Hirvonen@ktl.fi
Karjalainen Anna	KTL	Anna.Karjalainen@ktl.fi
Kiviranta Hannu	KTL	hannu.kiviranta@ktl.fi
Kronberg-Kippilä Carina	KTL	Carina.Kronberg-Kippila@ktl.fi
Ladefoged Ole	DTU	OL@food.dtu.dk
Leino Olli	KTL	Olli.Leino@ktl.fi
Pohjola Mikko	KTL	Mikko.Pohjola@ktl.fi
Pratt Iona	FSAI	ipratt@fsai.ie
Tuomisto Jouko	KTL	Jouko.Tuomisto@ktl.fi
Tuomisto Jouni	KTL	Jouni.Tuomisto@ktl.fi

Invited guests attending the meeting

Scientific Advisory Panel

Benford Diane	FSAI	Diane.Benford@foodstandards.gsi.gov.uk
Boobis Alan	Imperial College	a.boobis@imperial.ac.uk
van der Voet Hilko	WU	hilko.vandervoet@wur.nl
Carlander David	EFSA	David.CARLANDER@efsa.europa.eu

EC reviewers

Bucchini Luca	Hylobates Consulting srl	lucabucchini@hylobates.it
Schuhmacher Marta	Rovira i Virgili University	marta.schuhmacher@urv.es

Scientific Officer

Spulber Maria	European Commission	Maria.SPULBER@ec.europa.eu
---------------	---------------------	--

4. ORGANISATION AND AGENDA FOR THE MEETING

The meeting was organised in such manner that the first day of the meeting the participants of the Qalibra and Beneris projects presented the progress of their projects to the EC reviewers and the SAP, covering the entire timeline from project start until the end of September 2008. The second day the two project consortia convened their separate project meetings for detailed discussion of technical and project management issues, the reviewers started drafting their evaluation reports, based on the presentations, discussions, and advance documents (1st-period deliverables, reports, etc.) and the SAP met to discuss the projects on their own (based on the presentations and documents provided in advance) and to agree on their feedback to both project consortia. The third day the participants from both projects reconvened and the SAP provided feedback to each project and participated in discussions of the matters raised. Furthermore, the next stages of each project were discussed together with the SAP and the next phase of the cluster activities was discussed and action points defined.

The agenda for the cluster meeting is here below:

Day / time Meeting room	Topic
Wed, 7 Nov Room F1/A-C	Day 1. All participants meet together: Qalibra, Beneris, Science Advisory Panel (SAP), EC representatives and reviewers.
08:45	Welcome and introductions. Confirmation of agenda.
	Presentation and discussion of Qalibra:
09:15	WPs 1 and 4: Development of methodology and application in case study 1A (oily fish).
10:15	WP 5: Preliminary work on case study 2 (functional foods).
10:30	<i>Refreshments break</i>
11:00	WP 2: Development of web-enabled software.
12:00	WP 3: Approaches for communication of risk-benefit information.
12:30	WPs 6 and 7: Management and clustering.
13:00	<i>Lunch</i>
	Presentation and discussion of Beneris:
14:00	WP 1: METHOD: Open risk assessment; BBN
15:00	WP 2: DATABASES: Food intake
15:30	<i>Refreshments break</i>
16:00	WP 2: DATABASES: Contaminants
16:30	WPs 3 and 4: CASE STUDY: Fish
16:50	WP 5: DISSEMINATION: Internet toolbox
17:20	WP 6: MANAGEMENT AND CLUSTERING.
17:40	General discussion. Identification of key issues for days 2 and 3.
18:00	Close.
19:30	<i>Joint dinner</i>

Thu, 8 Nov	Day 2. Four separate meetings:
Room F1/A	EC reviewers
Room F1/B	Beneris
Room F1/C	Qalibra
Room I4 (building I)	SAP
	<i>Note: during this day, the SAP and EC reviewers may ask to see individuals from either project to answer questions for short periods, if required. Timing to be arranged to fit other agenda items.</i>
09:00	Briefing and confirmation of agenda in each meeting.
10:30	<i>Refreshments break</i>
12:30	<i>Lunch in the cafeteria (all meetings join together)</i>
15:00	<i>Refreshments break</i>
17:00	Close.
19:00	<i>Joint dinner</i>

Fri, 9 Nov	Day 3. All participants meet together.
Room F1/A-C	
08:30	Feedback from SAP on both projects <i>Note: The SAP may organise this period as they wish. This could include presentations by SAP member(s) and time for discussion or project responses.</i>
10:30	<i>Refreshments break</i>
11:00	Brief summary of main action points for Qalibra , including those arising from SAP feedback and Day 2 project meeting
11:20	Brief summary of main action points for Beneris , including those arising from SAP feedback and Day 2 project meeting
11:40	Future cluster activities and interactions with other projects (e.g. BRAFO). Dates for future meetings.
12:30	Meeting closes.
12:30	<i>Lunch</i>

5. SUMMARY OF MEETING ACTIONS

The first day of the meeting participants of the Qalibra and Beneris projects presented the progress of their projects to the participants of both projects as well as the scientific officer, EC reviewers and the SAP, covering the entire timeline from project start until the end of September 2008. The second day the two project consortia convened their separate project meetings, the reviewers started drafting their evaluation reports and the SAP met to discuss the projects on their own and to agree on their feedback to both project consortia. The third day the participants from both projects reconvened and the SAP provided feedback to each project and participated in discussions of the matters raised. Further, the next stages of each project were discussed together with the SAP and the next phase of the cluster activities discussed and action points defined. **In total there are 6 actions related to cluster activities, which are presented with bold letters in the table below. For each action either a person or partner is defined that is responsible for the action and a deadline is given for the finalisation of the action. The finalisations of actions on time should ensure the progress of the cluster activities in the two EU projects.**

The presentations that were given by Qalibra and Beneris representatives during the first day of the meeting are attached in Annex for further information.

5.1. Summary of the discussions, main conclusions and the actions defined

The table below contains summary of the discussions, main conclusions and the actions defined (**actions indicated with bold letters in the table**) during the meeting.

	Action and discussion points	Who	When
	Qalibra Beneris Cluster activities		
1.	Comment from reviewers: It is necessary to increase the collaboration between the two projects on methodology etc		
2.	Comment from reviewers: Important to ensure that the 2 projects do not duplicate efforts		
3.	Provide a dictionary so same terms have the same meaning between projects.		
4.	Harmonize dose response data with Beneris?		
5.	More meetings together?		
6.	Action. Make a draft for sharing population data and model runs.	Beneris	Feb 2008
7.	Action. Store data in one place i.e. to develop a common data repository. Jouni will make a proposal.	Jouni	Dec 2007

8.	Validate Beneris tool by using their data. I.e. calculate for the Finnish population. (Beneris will do the same for Qalibra).		
9.	Can we get extra money for the cluster activities? Wait for the report of the European Commission and then explore our options.		
10.	Work together on dissemination? This is a suggestion from the European Commission. Is cooperation in this area according to the original plan? (Yes, according to Jouni) We have no budget for this (Helga).		
11.	Action. Jouni to send Qalibra a draft of their dissemination plan. Qalibra will add into the draft. Decide on a dissemination plan around April 2008.	Jouni	ASAP
12.	The process regarding sharing data that is described in cluster agreement was explained by Helga		
13.	Documents to share with Beneris: All reports and deliverables that are finished and the responsible people do not object to them being shared.		
14.	Action. Increase the interactions between QALIBRA & BENERIS and exploit the potential for synergy between the projects	Matis and Beneris	April 2008
15.	Gordon conference: 7th Valamo conference on environment and health-approaches to benefit-risk assessment, Heinavesi, Finland, Valamo monestery, 3-5 Dec 2007, organized by Beneris.		
16.	Workshop on open risk assessment method development and evaluation, Kuopio, Finland, 18-22 Feb 2008, organized by Beneris.		
17.	Roger Cooke at Delft University (Beneris partner) plans to visit CSL in the near future to exchange ideas on methodology.	CSL & Delft	Nov 2007
18.	Cluster webpages: www.qalibra-beneris.eu & www.beneris-qalibra.eu .		
19.	Action. Decide on purpose, if Beneris members plan to attend either or both of next two Qalibra meetings.	Andy	ASAP
20.	Action. Contact Altagra and ask if the can arrange the final meeting in June 2009 in Budapest and set up a Doodle website to determine the best time 1-18 June 2009	Helga	Nov 2007

6 CONCLUSIONS

During this three day meeting, the participants had successful discussions about the work carried out in the two projects so far, which will, hopefully result in a better way to achieve the challenging joint actions of the two clustered projects. Both projects also received valuable feedback from the SAP, which was presented to the two consortiums during the third day of the meeting. In addition, the participants got to know each other, both socially and professionally. The two consortiums need to establish further ground for the common work and dissemination actions.

APPENDIX Overheads presented during the meeting.

Title of presentation	Presenter
WPs 1 and 4: Development of methodology and application in case study 1A (oily fish).	Andy Hart
WP 5: Preliminary work on case study 2 (functional foods).	Jeljer Hoekstra
WP 2: Development of web-enabled software.	Matthew Atkinson & Christos Fidas
WP 3: Approaches for communication of risk-benefit information.	Andy Hart
WPs 6 and 7: Management and clustering.	Helga Gunnlaugsdottir
WP 1: METHOD: Open risk assessment; BBN	Jouni Tuomisto & Roger Cooke
WP 2: DATABASES: Food intake	Tero Hirvonen
WP 2: DATABASES: Contaminants	Max Hansen & Hannu Kirianta
WPs 3 and 4: CASE STUDY: Fish	Olli Leino
WP 5: DISSEMINATION: Internet toolbox	Anna Karjalainen
WP 6: MANAGEMENT AND CLUSTERING.	Anna Karjalainen & Jouni Tuomisto
Feedback from SAP on both projects	David Carlander
Brief summary of main action points for Qalibra , including those arising from SAP feedback and Day 2 project meeting	Andy Hart
Brief summary of main action points for Beneris , including those arising from SAP feedback and Day 2 project meeting	Jouni Tuomisto
Future cluster activities	Helga Gunnlaugsdottir
